

**THE DULY ELECTED MEMBERS OF THE BOARD OF COUNTY COMMISSIONERS OF WASHINGTON COUNTY, OHIO, MET IN REGULAR SESSION ON SEPTEMBER 25, 2014 IN ACCORDANCE WITH OHIO REVISED CODE 305.05, WITH THE FOLLOWING MEMBERS PRESENT: RONALD L. FEATHERS, PRESIDENT, DAVID A. WHITE, VICE PRESIDENT, TIMOTHY C. IRVINE, MEMBER. THE MEETING WAS CALLED TO ORDER AT 9:00 A.M. BY THE PRESIDENT OF THE BOARD. MR. FEATHERS LED THOSE ATTENDING IN THE PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE TO OUR FLAG.**

Also attending were Muskingum Township Trustee Gary Doan, Justin Bradley from WMOA Radio, Amanda Nicholson from *The Marietta Times*, Debora Johnson from Schwendeman Insurance Agency, and Clerk Rick Peoples.

**Washington County Commissioners  
AGENDA  
9:00 a.m., September 25, 2014**

9:00 Business Meeting  
9:15 Dawn Rauch, Community Action – Moving Ohio Forward Program  
9:30 Chris Franzman, Squire Patton Boggs LLP – Bond Financing  
10:00 Kathy Dodrill, OSU Extension – Program Update  
10:30 Dorothy Peppel, County Treasurer – Investment Committee  
11:00 Sandy Lahmers, Soil & Water Conservation District – Projects Update  
11:30 Health Insurance Plan for County Employees for 2015

**UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

Appointment to Local Emergency Planning Committee (3)

**NEW BUSINESS**

Approve Agenda  
Approval of previous meeting's minutes  
Bills from various departments  
Resolution – Retirement of Ted Williams from County Home  
Resolution – Wellness Incentive Plan  
Additional Appropriation – Law Library  
Transfer – Probate/Juvenile  
Transfer – RSVP  
Transfer – Commissioners  
Transfer – Family & Children First  
Transfer – Board of Developmental Disabilities  
Then & Now's  
Travel – Auditor  
Travel – Family & Children First (4)  
Travel – Job and Family Services  
Travel – Director of Human Resources, Safety and Loss Control  
Travel – RSVP (2)  
Appointment to Workforce Investment Board  
Subgrant Agreement - Child Support Enforcement Agency  
Engineer – Request from Ludlow Township for Road Use & Maintenance Agreement

**INFORMATION**

Budget Hearings Continue Next Week  
Retirement Reception for Ted Williams, 1:00-3:00 p.m., Tuesday, September 30,  
County Home  
Zimmer Farm Tour, 9:00 a.m., Wednesday, October 1

**RE: AGENDA**

Mr. White moved and Mr. Irvine seconded a motion to accept the agenda with the following revision:

Add: Travel – Engineer  
Travel – Building Permit  
Delete: 11:00 Sandy Lahmers, Soil & Water Conservation District

A calling of the roll resulted in the following vote: Ronald Feathers aye, David White aye, Timothy Irvine aye. Motion passed.

**RE: APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

Mr. Irvine moved and Mr. White seconded a motion to approve the minutes of the September 18, 2014 meeting, and to dispense with the reading of them.

A calling of the roll resulted in the following vote: Ronald Feathers aye, David White aye, Timothy Irvine aye. Motion passed.

**RE: PAYMENT OF BILLS**

Mr. Irvine moved and Mr. White seconded a motion to approve the payment of bills from various departments.

A calling of the roll resulted in the following vote: Ronald Feathers aye, David White aye, Timothy Irvine aye. Motion passed.

**RE: RESOLUTION RECOGNIZING SERVICE OF TED WILLIAMS**

Mr. White moved and Mr. Irvine seconded a motion to adopt the following resolution, recognizing the thirty-five years of service of County Home Administrator Ted Williams as he begins retirement October 1, 2014:

***WHEREAS**, on October 5, 1979, Ted Williams was appointed to the position of Administrator of the Washington County Home; and*

***WHEREAS**, Ted Williams has faithfully served as Washington County Home Administrator for thirty-five (35) years; and*

***WHEREAS**, Ted Williams, having shared much of his life with the residents of the Washington County Home, completes his public service upon his retirement on September 30, 2014; and*

***WHEREAS**, a variety of hats have been worn, and tasks assumed, by Ted Williams at the County Home, including livestock manager, cook, recreational director, tour guide, farmer, advisor, provider, and counselor; and*

***WHEREAS**, Ted Williams has served the residents of the Washington County Home with pride, grace, dedication, respect and honor, demonstrating outstanding professionalism, courtesy, cooperation and good humor.*

***NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED** that the Board of Commissioners of Washington County, Ohio, on behalf of the citizens of Washington County, extends to Ted Williams appropriate recognition and appreciation for his thirty-five years of exemplary service to Washington County as Administrator of the Washington County Home.*

***BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED** that the Board of Commissioners of Washington County, Ohio, extends to Ted Williams*

**Congratulations on a Job Very Well Done**  
and  
**Best Wishes in Retirement**

A calling of the roll resulted in the following vote: Ronald Feathers aye, David White aye, Timothy Irvine aye. Motion passed.

**RE: RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING ELECTED OFFICIALS AND COUNTY EMPLOYEES TO PARTICIPATE IN WELLNESS INCENTIVE PROGRAM AND HEALTH INSURANCE REDUCTION PLAN**

Mr. Irvine moved and Mr. White seconded a motion to adopt the following resolution authorizing County employees and elected officials to participate in the County's health insurance plan(s) with a portion of the monthly premium(s) paid by the County, and the Wellness Incentive program allowing for reduction of cost of health insurance to participants:

***WHEREAS**, employees and elected officials of Washington County are eligible to participate in health, dental, vision and/or life insurance programs offered by and through the County; and*

***WHEREAS**, Washington County has implemented a Wellness Incentive Program allowing for reduction in premium for health insurance to those employees and elected officials participating in a certain number of wellness activities, including health screenings, annual check-ups, vaccinations, health risk assessment, and other preventative and health-improvement endeavors; and*

***WHEREAS**, Washington County provides a portion of the cost of health insurance for eligible employees and elected officials.*

***NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED** by the Board of Commissioners of Washington County, Ohio that employees and elected officials of Washington County are eligible to participate in health, dental, vision and/or life insurance programs offered by and through the County, with a portion of the premium for health insurance paid by the County.*

***BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED** by the Board of Commissioners of Washington County, Ohio that employees and elected officials of Washington County who complete a minimum number of wellness and preventative activities by October 31, 2014, and document those activities on a Wellness Scorecard in accordance with guidelines established for the Washington County*



October 3, 2014.

Cindy Davis: One-day trip to Columbus to attend Ohio Family & Children First Executive Committee meeting; October 10, 2014.

#### JFS

Candy Nelson: Two-day trip to Dellroy to attend Canton District Directors Conference; October 28-29, 2014.

#### Human Resources

Darla Miller: One-day trip to Delaware, Ohio to attend Fall County Loss Control Coordinators meeting; September 26, 2014.

#### RSVP

Lisa Valentine: Two-day trip to Columbus to attend Annual Ohio Conference on Volunteerism; October 20-21, 2014.

Lisa Valentine, Kelsey Martin: One-day trip to Columbus to attend Community Connections Luncheon and Storytelling Workshop; October 3, 2014.

#### Engineer

Calvin Becker, Brian Bailey: One-day trip to Logan to attend a road signs seminar; October 16, 2014.

#### Building Department

Mike Stalnaker: One-day trip to Gahanna to take the residential electrical inspector examination; September 26, 2014.

A calling of the roll resulted in the following vote: Ronald Feathers aye, David White aye, Timothy Irvine aye. Motion passed.

#### **RE: RE-APPOINTMENT TO AREA 15 WORKFORCE INVESTMENT BOARD**

Mr. White moved and Mr. Irvine seconded a motion to re-appoint Sherri Becker to the Area 15 Workforce Investment Board for the term July 1, 2014 through June 30, 2016.

A calling of the roll resulted in the following vote: Ronald Feathers aye, David White aye, Timothy Irvine aye. Motion passed.

#### **RE: SUBGRANT AGREEMENT, CSEA AND JFS**

Mr. Irvine moved and Mr. White seconded a motion to approve a Subgrant Agreement between the Washington County Child Support Enforcement Agency (CSEA) and Department of Job and Family Services (JFS), allowing JFS to pay to CSEA an amount not to exceed \$20,000.00 during the period October 1, 2014 through September 30, 2015, for appropriate services as detailed in the Agreement, as requested by Kim Hinkle, Child Support Enforcement Agency.

A calling of the roll resulted in the following vote: Ronald Feathers aye, David White aye, Timothy Irvine aye. Motion passed.

#### **RE: ROAD USE MAINTENANCE AGREEMENT, LUDLOW TOWNSHIP**

Mr. Irvine moved and Mr. White seconded a motion to approve a request from the Ludlow Township Trustees to allow County Engineer Roger Wright to prepare and negotiate a Road Use and Maintenance Agreement for roads in Ludlow Township, and to allow Mr. Feathers to sign the Request, as prepared and recommended by the Trustees of Ludlow Township.

A calling of the roll resulted in the following vote: Ronald Feathers aye, David White aye, Timothy Irvine aye. Motion passed.

#### **RE: MOVING OHIO FORWARD PROGRAM**

Dawn Rauch, Washington-Morgan Community Action Program, informed the Commissioners there are insufficient Moving Ohio Forward Program funds in Washington County to schedule another demolition, but she is aware of a proposal from the Ohio Attorney General to fund Phase III of the Program. If Phase III is implemented, Ms. Rauch said she will request transfer of unused Phase II funds into Phase III.

Mr. White moved and Mr. Irvine seconded a motion to approve a Request for Reimbursement from the Moving Ohio Forward Program for the demolition of a structure at 511/513 Main Street, Belpre, Ohio, in the amount of \$7,697.00, and to allow Mr. Feathers to sign the Request, as prepared by Dawn Rauch, Washington-Morgan Community Action Program.

A calling of the roll resulted in the following vote: Ronald Feathers aye, David White aye, Timothy Irvine aye. Motion passed.

**RE: CHIP**

Mr. White moved and Mr. Irvine seconded a motion to send a Fiscal Year 2014 Community Housing Improvement Program (CHIP) Conditional Award Letter, as prepared and requested by Dawn Rauch, Washington-Morgan Community Action Program.

A calling of the roll resulted in the following vote: Ronald Feathers aye, David White aye, Timothy Irvine aye. Motion passed.

Ms. Rauch informed the Commissioners that a Fair Housing Analysis must be done for the CHIP Program in Washington County every three years, and it is now time for one to be done. She noted that Darlene Lukshin traditionally does this analysis for Washington County and the Cities of Marietta and Belpre. She suggested utilizing CHIP recapture funds to help fund the project along with contributions from Washington County, the City of Marietta, and the City of Belpre.

**RE: BOND FINANCING OF COUNTY PROJECTS**

Chris Franzmann, Squire Patton Boggs LLP, talked with the Commissioners about options for financing major projects in Washington County. He noted he serves as Bond Counsel primarily for counties and cities throughout Ohio. He said he assisted the Washington County Commissioners when they refunded/refinanced bonds in 2011 and 2012. Mr. Franzmann noted there are options for funding projects, including bonds, commercial loans, OWDA loans, OPWC loans, and USDA grants and loans. He said the OPWC funds are usually applied to transportation infrastructure projects. Depending on the project and economics at the time of application, Mr. Franzmann indicated OWDA might be the most attractive funding source. OWDA and OPWC do not utilize bond counsel, in accordance with Ohio law. He also said OWDA requirements for engineering studies may be more stringent than those of commercial lenders.

Mr. Franzmann offered his continuing advice and counsel pertaining to financing sewer construction projects in Washington County.

President Feathers said the County is currently under Findings & Orders from the Ohio EPA to address a situation in Devola, but the Commissioners are awaiting their response to a revised general plan. He said current directive from the EPA is for the County to begin construction in Devola by June of 2015.

**RE: EXTENSION OFFICE PROGRAMS**

Kathy Dodrill, Family and Consumer Sciences, OSU Extension Office, updated the Commissioners on several programs, including:

- Healthy People – SNAP-Ed, Food & Nutrition, Dining with Diabetes, Food Safety, etc.
- Healthy Finances – Money Management, Home Ownership, Financial Coaching
- Healthy Relationships – Parenthood, Child Development, Fatherhood, Co-Parenting, etc.
- Promotion of Local Foods
- Safetytowns
- Sun Safety
- Literacy

Ms. Dodrill informed the Commissioners the recent award of a grant to OSU Extension allows for the placement of a part-time SNAP-Ed position in schools, specifically to work with students in the second and third grades.

Ms. Dodrill thanked the Commissioners for their continuing support, and encouraged them to promote the programs she makes available throughout the County.

**RE: INVESTMENT COMMITTEE**

County Treasurer reported to the Commissioners that Washington County has earned from January 1, 2014 through August 31, 2014 interest on investments amounting to \$83,327.10, at the interest rate of 0.035000%. She said the County's depository is Peoples Banking & Trust Company. Ms. Peppel noted the County's interest rate dropped from 1.15% to 0.035% in June of 2013, and that has resulted in the loss of about \$100,000 in year-to-date interest earnings.

**RE: HEALTH INSURANCE PLAN FOR COUNTY EMPLOYEES FOR 2015**

Mr. White moved and Mr. Irvine seconded a motion to open discussion on health insurance program options for Washington County for the year beginning January 1, 2015.

A calling of the roll resulted in the following vote: Ronald Feathers aye, David White aye, Timothy Irvine aye. Motion passed.

Attending were the Commissioners, the Clerk, Director of Human Resources Darla Miller, Schwendeman Insurance Agency representatives Debora Johnson, Larry Schwendeman and Christi Mullins, and Amanda Nicholson of *The Marietta Times*.

Speaking on behalf of The Health Plan (THP), Ms. Johnson addressed the following issues:

- THP has a good network of physicians and service providers, but can't adequately compare that network to the CEBCO plan without additional information.
- GlobalCare has a contractual relationship with THP to re-price any and all out-of-network claims for PPO products.
- GlobalCare has access to a multitude of networks throughout the United States.
- The average discount vs billed charges with GlobalCare has been 34%.
- The average THP provider discount from billed charges averages 47%.

Mr. Schwendeman reminded the Commissioners that THP offers to Washington County a plan that costs approximately \$270,000 less than the proposed plan from CEBCO. He said this is an accurate number, as he used actual claims experience and other factual data to determine it. He noted one distinct advantage of THP is "they work off of non-profit structure". He noted the Belmont County Commissioners left THP at a time when THP's renewal rate proposal was only slightly higher than the CEBCO/Anthem proposal they selected. Mr. Schwendeman thanked the Commissioners for the opportunity to propose a health insurance plan for County employees. He said a Wellness Program can be tied into THP, funded by savings realized from lower premiums. Mr. Schwendeman noted his agency works for clients, not for carriers.

Director of Human Resources Darla Miller thanked the Schwendeman Agency for quoting and for working so well with her to provide an abundance of information to the Commissioners. She said she recommends the Commissioners renew with CEBCO for the following reasons:

- As a member of a consortium the County realizes long-term protection against renewal rate volatility.
- CEBCO started in 2004 and now has 33 member counties, with the loss of no counties over the years.
- Reference checks for THP revealed some customer service issues and high rate increases, resulting in organizations remaining with THP for only a short time.
- The County has received an average of less than 6% increase from CEBCO during the past six years.
- The renewal plan premiums proposed by CEBCO for 2015 are only 0.50% higher than current plan premiums.
- THP offers lower premiums for next year and a 20% rate cap for the following two years, but there is risk in changing carriers and long-term budget stabilization strategy while the Affordable Care Act is being implemented.
- Feedback received from County departments and agencies is clear indication that employees do not want to move from CEBCO at this time.

Commissioner Irvine said this is a very difficult decision. He expressed his appreciation to the Schwendeman Agency representatives for their work in preparing their proposal.

Mr. Irvine said for the following reasons he believes the CEBCO/Anthem plan is the better option for Washington County at this time:

- CEBCO is a consortium consisting of approximately 11,500 employees in 33 Ohio counties, which provides leverage. He believes belonging to a large pool rather than a small pool will benefit the County.
- Anthem Blue Cross & Blue Shield is a large national insurer, while THP is a small regional insurer. As a result, Anthem is better able to negotiate lower rates for service and that directly impacts the County's loss ratio.
- As the Affordable Care Act is fully implemented the County will have the advantage of being a part of a consortium with large membership.
- Washington County has six years of experience with CEBCO, which has provided low, stable renewal rates and good service with relatively few complaints.
- All departmental representatives attending informational meetings with CEBCO and THP prefer to renew with CEBCO.

Referencing a recent article in the local news media, Commissioner White said he finds it both reprehensible and deplorable that there was connotation that favoritism may have resulted from contributions to any of the Commissioners' political campaigns. He said the Commissioners have taken their responsibility very seriously in considering the options available to them.

Mr. White noted:

- This is a very challenging decision, largely because the insurance industry is very much based on fear of the unknown.
- Recognizing the savings offered by The Health Plan over CEBCO, if he was making this decision for his personal business he would opt for the lower cost plan.
- It is not possible to get a "clean" comparison of the two proposals, as the plans are different in design and the data is complex.

- The health care industry is at this time very volatile, with many changes resulting from enactment of the Affordable Care Act.
- CEBCO offered no cap on future renewal rates, but they have a good track record of low rate changes for Washington County.
- THP offers a cap of 20% on rate increases for two years.
- THP does not have good client retention compared to CEBCO, as reference checks revealed that several organizations once with THP left after only a relatively short time, and there have been no counties leave CEBCO since its inception in 2004.
- His responsibility is not only to 352 Washington County employees, but also to 60,000 Washington County citizens.

Commissioner White said he favors moving from the CEBCO plan to The Health Plan.

President Feathers thanked the Schwendeman Agency representatives for their extensive effort in providing a proposal for Commissioners' consideration.

Mr. Feathers said:

- If this was a personal business decision, he would likely favor the lower cost plan from THP.
- The selection of health plans can't be made solely on financial impact, as future risk, continuity of service, history of renewal rate increases, and ability to manage transition into a new health care arena must be factored in.
- The Commissioners have independently, and collectively, reviewed a wealth of data provided by both CEBCO and the Schwendeman Agency.
- He is impressed with CEBCO because premium rate increases have been relatively stable since its inception in 2004, Anthem is a large national company with negotiating influence and power, and counties have regularly joined the CEBCO group but none have left.
- He recognizes THP promises a cap of 20% premium rate increase for the next two years, and the lower premiums offered for 2015.
- He is concerned about those organizations and entities that moved to THP but left a short time later.
- By his calculations, there is a difference of approximately \$180,000 between the two proposals for 2015.
- Sometimes "cheaper shoes aren't always the best shoes".

Commissioner Feathers said that after much consideration, conversation, and deliberation he will vote to renew with CEBCO.

Mr. Irvine moved and Mr. Feathers seconded a motion to renew the Anthem Blue Cross & Blue Shield health insurance plan offered through CEBCO for the year beginning January 1, 2015.

A calling of the roll resulted in the following vote: Ronald Feathers aye, David White no, Timothy Irvine aye. Motion passed.

The representatives from the Schwendeman Agency expressed to the Commissioners their appreciation for the opportunity to provide their proposal.

**RE: CEBCO PARTICIPATION AGREEMENT**

Mr. Irvine moved and Mr. White seconded a motion to approve the Participation Agreement with the County Employee Benefit Consortium of Ohio, Inc. (CEBCO) for a three-year period beginning January 2, 2015 and extending through December 31, 2017.

A calling of the roll resulted in the following vote: Ronald Feathers aye, David White aye, Timothy Irvine aye. Motion passed.

**RE: ADJOURNMENT**

Mr. Irvine moved and Mr. White seconded a motion to adjourn.

A calling of the roll resulted in a unanimous vote in favor. The meeting adjourned at 12:00 p.m.

\_\_\_\_\_, President

\_\_\_\_\_, Vice President

\_\_\_\_\_, Member

\_\_\_\_\_, Clerk

